



राष्ट्रीय अनुसूचित जनजाति आयोग
National Commission for Scheduled Tribes

(भारत के संविधान के अनुच्छेद 338क के अंतर्गत एक संवैधानिक निकाय)
(A constitutional body under Article 338A of the Constitution of India)

F. No. NCST/SER-1478/MSTL/9/2024-SSW

Dated: 18.03.2025

To,

Shri Amarendu Prakash,
Chairman,
Steel Authority of India Ltd,
Ispat Bhawan, Lodhi Road,
New Delhi- 110003
Email Id: chairman.sail@sail.in
Tel. No: 24367313

Shri S. K. Verma,
Executive Director,
Centre For Engineering & Technology,
SAIL, Po-Doranda,
Ranchi (Jharkhand) - 834002
Email Id: edcetsail@sail.in
Tel. No: 8986874021

Sub: Harassment of ST employee by the management of SAIL- a representation dated 22.08.2024 of Shri Hemmu Toppo (GM and HoD (Civil and Structural), Centre of Engineering & Technology,) SAIL, Ranchi.

Sir/Madam,

I am directed to enclose herewith a copy of Minutes of the Sitting taken by **Shri Nirupam Chakma, Hon'ble Member, NCST, New Delhi on 28.02.2025 at 12:00 noon** on the above mentioned subject for necessary action.

2. It is requested that Action Taken Report/Compliance Report on the recommendations of Minutes of Sitting may be furnished to this Commission within **15 days** positively.

Encl: as Above.


(H.R. Meena)

Research Officer

E-Mail: researchofficer-esdw@ncst.nic.in

Copy for information to: -

Shri Hemmu Toppo,
Khokhma Toli, Airport Road,
Behind Indian Meteorology Science Department,
P.O.- Hundru, Via-Hatia,Ranchi,
Jharkhand- 834002
Mobile No:8986880509

1. PS to Hon'ble Member (Shri Nirupam Chakma)
2. NIC for uploading.



राष्ट्रीय अनुसूचित जनजाति आयोग
National Commission for Scheduled Tribes

(भारत के संविधान के अनुच्छेद 338क के अंतर्गत एक संवैधानिक निकाय)
(A constitutional body under Article 338A of the Constitution of India)

File No: NCST/SER-1478/MSTL/9/2024-SSW

Minutes of the Sitting held on 28.02.2025 at 12:00 Noon under the Chairmanship of Shri Nirupam Chakma, Hon'ble Member, NCST, New Delhi on Petition of Shri Hemmu Toppo, Ranchi, Jharkhand regarding "Petition for Investigation into Discriminatory Practices in Promotion Process at SAIL Affecting Scheduled Tribe Employee."

Date of Sitting: 28.02.2025 at 12:00 Noon

List of Participants: As per Annexure

The petition dated 22.08.2024, submitted by the petitioner, a General Manager and Head of the Civil & Structural Department at the Centre for Engineering & Technology (CET), Ranchi, under the Steel Authority of India Limited (SAIL), highlights concerns regarding an unjust denial of promotion to Grade E-8 (Chief General Manager). As a member of the Scheduled Tribe, the petitioner claims that despite achieving the highest scores in performance, qualifications, and length of service, he was overlooked for promotion. The promotion criteria for Grade E-7 to E-8 at SAIL include Average Credit Points for the last 4 years' performance (60 points), Qualification Points (15 points), Length of Service Points (10 points), and Interview (15 points), totaling 100 points. The petitioner scored 80.50 out of 85 based on the criteria, yet the interview marks—whose specifics remain unknown—were allegedly manipulated, resulting in a lower rank and the denial of promotion. The petitioner asserts that the decision was influenced by discriminatory practices due to his Scheduled Tribe status, with management allegedly favoring other candidates. He requests the intervention of the National Commission for Scheduled Tribes (NCST) to thoroughly investigate the matter and ensure a fair and transparent promotion process, particularly for Scheduled Tribe employees, who have minimal representation in higher grades at SAIL.

The Commission issued notice to Chairman, Steel Authority Of India Ltd, Ispat Bhawan, Lodhi Road, New Delhi and Executive Director, Centre For Engineering And Technology, Sail, Po-Doranda, Ranchi, Jharkhand on 30.09.2024 and sought a ATR/Compliance Report within 30 days of the receipt of the notice. The reply dated 22.11.2024 from the Centre for Engineering & Technology (CET), Ranchi, addresses the concerns raised by the petitioner, Shri Hemmu Toppo, regarding caste-based discrimination and injustice in the promotion process. The management asserts that promotions at SAIL are governed by the "Promotion Policy for Executives" approved by the SAIL Board of Directors. The

Departmental Promotion Committee (DPC) evaluates eligible candidates based on total points from performance, qualifications, length of service, and interview results. Despite meeting the minimum eligibility period, Shri Toppo was not recommended for promotion to Grade E-8 due to his comparative position in the merit list. The management emphasizes that an SC/ST representative is included in both the Interview Committee and the DPC to safeguard the interests of SC/ST candidates. The reply concludes that the petitioner has been considered for promotion in line with the policy and rules, and the allegations of discrimination are unfounded and without merit.

The reply was forwarded to the petitioner on 24.01.2025. In response to SAIL Management's letter dated 22.11.2024, Shri Hemmu Toppo, through his letter dated 08.02.2025, strongly disagrees with the claims made by the management. He asserts that, despite achieving the highest scores (80.5 out of 85) in performance, qualifications, and length of service, he was unjustly denied promotion to Grade E-8 due to the manipulation of interview marks. The petitioner emphasizes that, as the interview panel was aware of the candidates' total points prior to the interview, there was potential for bias and manipulation in assigning interview marks, thereby compromising the fairness of the process. Furthermore, he highlights the persistent delays in his career advancement, including the denial of a full appointment to the Head of Department (HoD) position for over 2.5 years, despite his qualifications. He challenges the management's claim of fairness, pointing out a clear pattern of discrimination against Scheduled Tribe employees, particularly in promotions to higher grades such as E-8. The petitioner urges the NCST to take prompt and decisive action to address the ongoing discrimination and rectify the unfair practices that have resulted in over eight years of lost career progression.

In the sitting, on behalf of the Chairman of the Steel Authority of India, New Delhi, the ED (HR) and CGM appeared. From the Centre for Engineering & Technology, Jharkhand, the ED and CGM (HR) appeared. The petitioner also attended the sitting. The concerned authority submitted that Shri Hemmu Toppo is one of the finest engineers in the department and the only ST individual who is the Head of the Department, so there is no case of discrimination. Moreover, they stated that he scored 79.3 marks in Total Credit Points (TCP) out of 85 marks, and there was a slight error in the calculation of marks by the petitioner. After the sitting, the Commission recommends that:-

The Steel Authority of India (SAIL) may submit the Merit list/Select list of candidates for the last three years (2021-2023), including the total marks in Total Credit Points (TCP) and breakup of the Interview marks obtained by each candidates considered for promotion from Grade E7 to E8, within 15 days from the date of receipt of the Minutes, for scrutiny and examination by the Commission.



(Nirupam Chakma)
Member, NCST

निरुपम चाकमा / Nirupam Chakma
सदस्य / Member
राष्ट्रीय अनुसूचित जनजाति आयोग
National Commission for Scheduled Tribes
त सरकार Government of India
नई दिल्ली, New Delhi